The British conquest of India included a period (ca. 1750-1832) marked by a demand for explanations of the religions of India, leading to the commissioning of a number of original writings on this subject in Persian — the principal language of governance and culture at the time. The analysis will highlight the tension between the different taxonomies of religion displayed in two texts, The Order of Yogis (1800) by Sital Singh “Bikhwud,” and Gardens of Religious Teachings (1812) by Mathuranath and it will explore the impact of Protestant and missionary concepts of religion on the emerging notion of Hinduism.